"Lattice QCD calculations of the excitedstate spectrum, and the low-energy degrees of freedom of QCD

David Richards Jefferson Laboratory/Hadron Spectrum

Collaboration

Kyoto, 26 Feb, 2015







Outline

- Spectroscopy: theory and experiment
- Lattice QCD Spectroscopy Recipe Book
- Results and insight
 - Light-meson spectroscopy and isoscalar
 - Decay constants
 - Charmonium
 - Baryons, and the search for gluons
- Strong decays
- Summary





Spectroscopy



Classic means of determining underlying degrees of freedom in a theory. *Probe the strong interaction and its underlying field theory Quantum Chromodynamics (QCD)*

Spectroscopy and QCD

- What are the key degrees of freedom describing the bound states protons, neutrons, pions,????
 - How do they change as we vary the quark mass **Charmonium**?
- What is the origin of confinement, describing 99% of observed matter?
- If QCD is correct and we understand it, expt. data must confront ab initio calculations
- What is the role of the gluon in the spectrum search for exotics





Meson Spectrum



- Exotic Mesons are those whose values of J^{PC} are in accessible to quark model: 0⁺⁻, 1⁻⁺, 2⁺⁻
- Multi-quark states:
- Hybrids with excitations of the flux-tube
- Study of hybrids: revealing gluonic degrees of freedom of QCD.
- *Glueballs:* purely, or predominantly, gluonic states







Baryon Spectroscopy

- No baryon "exotics", ie quantum numbers not accessible with simple quark model; but may be hybrids!
- Nucleon Spectroscopy: Quark model masses and amplitudes states classified by isospin, parity and spin.







Quantum Chromodynamics (QCD)



Lattice QCD

- Lattice QCD enables us to undertake ab initio computations of many of the low-energy properties of QCD
- Continuum Euclidean space time replaced by four-dimensional lattice – 24³ x 128 for talk today

$$\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = rac{1}{\mathcal{Z}} \prod_{x,\mu} dU_{\mu}(x) \prod_{x} d\psi(x) \prod_{x} d\bar{\psi}(x) \mathcal{O}(U,\psi,\bar{\psi}) e^{-S(U,\psi,\bar{\psi})}$$

where

$$S(U, \psi, \bar{\psi}) = -\frac{6}{g^2} \sum_{x} \operatorname{Tr} U_{Pl} + \sum_{x} \bar{\psi} M(U) \psi$$

$$\psi, \psi \text{ are Grassmann Variables}$$
Importance
Sampling
$$\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{1}{\mathcal{Z}} \prod_{x,\mu} dU_{\mu}(x) \mathcal{O}(U) \det M(U) e^{-S_g(U)}$$







Hierarchy of Computations



Highly regular problem, with simple boundary conditions – *very efficient* use of massively parallel computers using data-parallel programming.





Science per Dollar for (some) LQCD Capacity Applications



Low-lying Hadron Spectrum

Benchmark of LQCD $C(t) = \sum_{\vec{x}} \langle 0 \mid N(\vec{x}, t) \bar{N}(0) \mid 0 \rangle = \sum_{n, \vec{x}} \langle 0 \mid e^{ip \cdot x} N(0) e^{-ip \cdot x} \mid n \rangle \langle n \mid \bar{N}(0) \mid 0 \rangle$ $= |\langle n \mid N(0) \mid 0 \rangle |^2 e^{-E_n t} = \sum_n A_n e^{-E_n t}$



Durr et al., BMW Collaboration

Science 2008

Control over:

- Quark-mass dependence
- Continuum extrapolation
 - finite-volume effects (pions, resonances)





Variational Method

Subleading terms → *Excited* states

Construct matrix of correlators with judicious choice of operators

$$C_{ij}(t,0) = \frac{1}{V_3} \sum_{\vec{x},\vec{y}} \langle \mathcal{O}_i(\vec{x},t) \mathcal{O}_j^{\dagger}(\vec{y},0) \rangle = \sum_N \frac{Z_i^{N*} Z_j^N}{2E_N} e^{-E_N t}$$
$$Z_i^N \equiv \langle N \mid \mathcal{O}_i^{\dagger}(0) \mid 0 \rangle$$

Delineate contributions using *variational method*: solve

$$C(t)v^{(N)}(t,t_0) = \lambda_N(t,t_0)C(t_0)v^{(N)}(t,t_0).$$

$$\lambda_N(t,t_0) \longrightarrow e^{-E_N(t-t_0)},$$

Eigenvectors, with metric $C(t_0)$, are orthonormal and project onto the respective states

$$v^{(N')\dagger}C(t_0)v^{(N)} = \delta_{N,N'}$$

$$Z_i^N = \sqrt{2m_N} e^{m_N t_0/2} v_j^{(N)*} C_{ji}(t_0).$$



1



Challenges

To appreciate difficulty of extracting excited states, need to understand signal-to-noise ratio in two-point functions. Consider correlation function:

$$C(t) = \langle 0 \mid \mathcal{O}(t)\mathcal{O}(0)^{\dagger} \mid 0 \rangle \longrightarrow e^{-Et}$$

Then the fluctuations behave as DeGrand, Hecht, PRD46 (1992)

 $\sigma^{2}(t) \simeq \left(\langle 0 \mid |\mathcal{O}(t)\mathcal{O}(0)^{\dagger}|^{2} \mid 0 \rangle - C(t)^{2} \right) \longrightarrow e^{-2m_{\pi}t}$

Signal-to-noise ratio degrades with increasing E - Solution: anisotropic lattice with lattice spacing $a_t < a_s$ For heavy quarks $m a_t << 1$

Cubic symmetry of lattices







Glueball Spectroscopy - I

Triple-gluon vertex - Pure Yang-Mills spectrum. Morningstar, Peardon 97,99 Predicts existence of bound states.







Spectroscopy with Quarks

- Anisotropic lattices to precisely resolve energies
- Variational method with sufficient operator basis to delineate states
- Identification of spin Many Values of Lattice Spacing?

 $\begin{aligned} \mathbf{Anisotropic fermion action} & \text{Edwards, Joo, Lin, PRD78 (2008)} \\ S_G^{\xi}[U] &= \frac{\beta}{N_c \gamma_g} \left\{ \sum_{x,s>s'} \left[\frac{5}{3u_s^4} \mathcal{P}_{ss'} - \frac{1}{12u_s^6} \mathcal{R}_{ss'} \right] + \sum_{x,s} \left[\frac{4}{3u_s^2 u_t^2} \mathcal{P}_{st} - \frac{1}{12u_s^4 u_t^2} \mathcal{R}_{st} \right] \right\} \\ S_F^{\xi}[U, \overline{\psi}, \psi] &= \sum x \overline{\psi}(x) \frac{1}{\tilde{u}_t} \left\{ \tilde{u}_t \hat{m}_0 + \hat{W}_t + \frac{1}{\gamma_f} \sum_s \hat{W}_s - \frac{1}{2} \left[\frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{\gamma_g}{\gamma_f} + \frac{1}{\xi} \right) \frac{1}{\tilde{u}_t \tilde{u}_s^2} \sum_s \sigma_{ts} \hat{F}_{ts} + \frac{1}{\gamma_f} \frac{1}{\tilde{u}_s^3} \sum_{s < s'} \sigma_{ss'} \hat{F}_{ss'} \right] \right\} \psi(x). \end{aligned}$

Two anisotropy parameters to tune, in gauge and fermion sectors

$$\xi = 3.5 \qquad \begin{array}{rcl} \gamma_g &=& \xi_0 \\ \gamma_f &=& \xi_0/\nu \end{array} \text{ Dispersion Relation} \qquad \begin{array}{rcl} a_s \simeq 0.12 \text{ fm} \\ a_t \simeq 0.035 \text{ fm} \end{array}$$





Anisotropic Clover Generation - I



H-W Lin et al (Hadron Spectrum Collaboration), PRD79, 034502 (2009)

Proportional to *m*_l to LO ChPT





Anisotropic Clover – II



Low-lying spectrum: *agrees with experiment to 10%*

 $m_{\pi} \ge 400 \text{ MeV}$

No chiral extrapolations resonances N_f=2+1 Hadron Spectrum: NN Leading Order Extrapolation







Variational Method: Meson Operators

Aim: interpolating operators of *definite* (continuum) JM: O^{JM} $\langle 0 \mid O^{JM} \mid J', M' \rangle = Z^J \delta_{J,J'} \delta_{M,M'}$ Starting point $\bar{\psi}(\vec{x},t)\Gamma D_i D_j \dots \psi(\vec{x},t)$ Introduce circular basis: $\overleftrightarrow{D}_{m=-1} = \frac{i}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\overleftrightarrow{D}_x - i \overleftrightarrow{D}_y \right)$ $\overleftrightarrow{D}_{m=0} = i\overleftrightarrow{D}_{z}$ $\overleftarrow{D}_{m=+1} = -\frac{i}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\overleftarrow{D}_x + i \overleftarrow{D}_y \right).$ Straighforward to project to definite spin - for example J = 0, 1, 2 $(\Gamma \times D_{J=1}^{[1]})^{J,M} = \sum \langle 1, m_1; 1, m_2 | J, M \rangle \,\overline{\psi} \Gamma_{m_1} \overleftarrow{D}_{m_2} \psi.$ m_1, m_2 Use projection formula to find subduction under irrep. of cubic group operators are closed under rotation!





Correlation functions: Distillation

• Use the new "distillation" method.

Eigenvectors of / Laplacian

Includes displacements

- Observe $L^{(J)} \equiv (1 \frac{\kappa}{n}\Delta)^n = \sum_{i=1} f(\lambda_i) v^{(i)} \otimes v^{*(i)}$
- Truncate sum at sufficient i to capture relevant physics modes we use 64: set "weights" f to be unity
- Meson correlation function

$$C_M(t,t') = \langle 0 \mid \bar{d}(t')\Gamma^B(t')u(t')\bar{u}(t)\Gamma^A(t)d(t)|0\rangle$$

Decompose using "distillation" operator as

M. Peardon *et al.*, PRD80,054506 $C_M(t,t') = \text{Tr}\langle \phi^A(t')\tau(t',t)\Phi^B(t)\tau^{\dagger}(t',t), \rangle$ (2009) where

$$\begin{split} \Phi^{A,ij}_{\alpha\beta} &= v^{*(i)}(t) [\Gamma^A(t)\gamma_5]_{\alpha\beta} v^{(j)}(t') \\ \textbf{Perambulators} & \longrightarrow \tau^{ij}_{\alpha\beta}(t,t') &= v^{*(i)}(t') M^{-1}_{\alpha\beta}(t',t) v^{(j)}(t). \end{split}$$

Momentum Projection at Source and Sink!



•



Distillation - II

- Meson correlation functions N^3
- Baryon correlation functions N^4
- Stochastic sampling of eigenvectors *stochastic LaPH*

Morningstar et al, Phys.Rev.D83:114505,2011

Alternative idea: simpler orthonormal basis for the smearing function L

$$\sum_{i} \phi_{i}^{*}(x)\phi_{i}(y) = \delta(x-y), \sum_{x} \phi_{i}^{*}(x)\phi_{j}(x) = \delta_{ij}$$
 ir-wave basis

Colour-wave basis

$$\phi_i(x) = e^{-ipx} \delta_{s,s'} \delta_{c,c'}$$

Z.Brown, K.Orginos, arXiv:1210.1953





Identification of Spin







Isovector Meson Spectrum - I



Dudek *et al,* PRL 103:262001 (2009)

Isovector spectrum with quantum numbers reliably identified





Isovector Meson Spectrum - II







Interpretation of Meson Spectrum









Isoscalar Meson Spectrum



Dudek et al, arXiv:1309.2608, arXiv:0909.0200

Diagonalize in 2x2 *flavor space*

$$C = \begin{pmatrix} -\mathcal{C}^{\ell\ell} + 2\,\mathcal{D}^{\ell\ell} & \sqrt{2}\,\mathcal{D}^{\ell s} \\ \sqrt{2}\,\mathcal{D}^{s\ell} & -\mathcal{C}^{ss} + \mathcal{D}^{ss} \end{pmatrix}$$

- Spin-identified single-particle spectrum: states of spin as high as four
- Hidden flavor mixing angles extracted except 0⁻⁺, 1⁺⁺ near ideal mixing
- First determination of exotic isoscalar states: comparable in mass to isovector

J. Dudek et al., PRD73, 11502

Jefferson Lab





Charmonium

Operator construction follows light-quark Liuming Liu et al, arXiv: 1204.5425 Ignore annihilation contributions Charm quark mass set from ηc with scale set using Ω







Charmonium - II







Pseudoscalar Decay Constants

$$f_X = \frac{1}{m_X^2} m_q \langle 0 \mid \pi \mid X \rangle$$

e.g. Chang, Roberts, Tandy, arXiv:1107.4003

- Expectation from WT identity $f_{\pi_N} \equiv 0, N \geq 0$
- Compute in LQCD



McNeile and Michael, hep-lat/0607032





Pseudoscalar Decay - II







Look at overlaps with different classes of operators



• Strong suppression for second HYBRID state





Excited Baryon Spectrum - I

Construct basis of 3-quark interpolating operators in the continuum:

 $\left(N_{\mathsf{M}}\otimes \left(\frac{3}{2}^{-}\right)_{\mathsf{M}}^{1}\otimes D_{L=2,\mathsf{S}}^{[2]}
ight)^{J=\frac{t}{2}}$ "Flavor" x Spin x Orbital

Subduce to lattice irreps:



 $\mathcal{O}_{n\Lambda,r}^{[J]} = \sum_{M} \mathcal{S}_{n\Lambda,r}^{J,M} \mathcal{O}^{[J,M]} : \Lambda = G_{1g/u}, H_{g/u}, G_{2g/u}$

R.G.Edwards et al., arXiv:1104.5152

 $16^3 \times 128$ lattices $m_{\pi} = 524,444$ and 396 MeV

Observe remarkable realization of rotational symmetry at hadronic scale: reliably determine spins up to 7/2, for the first time in a lattice calculation





Excited Baryon Spectrum - II







Roper Resonance



Jefferson Lab

Thomas Jefferson National Accelerator Facility



33

Hybrid Baryon Spectrum

Original analysis ignore hybrid operators of form $D_{l=1,M}^{[2]}$









Putting it Together

Common mechanism in meson and baryon hybrids: chromomagnetic field with $E_g \sim 1.2 - 1.3 \text{ GeV}$







Flavor Structure

$SU(3)_F$	\mathbf{S}	L		J^P		
$8_{ m F}$	$\frac{1}{2}$ $\frac{3}{2}$	1 1	$\frac{1}{2}^{-}$ $\frac{1}{2}^{-}$	$\frac{3}{2} - \frac{3}{2}$	$\frac{5}{2}^{-}$	
$N_8(J)$			2	2	1	
$10_{ m F}$	$\frac{1}{2}$	1	$\frac{1}{2}^{-}$	$\frac{3}{2}^{-}$		
$N_{10}(J)$			1	1	0	
$1_{ m F}$	$\frac{1}{2}$	1	$\frac{1}{2}^{-}$	$\frac{3}{2}^{-}$		
$N_1(J)$			1	1	0	

One derivative

$SU(3)_F$	\mathbf{S}	\mathbf{L}	J^P				
85	$\frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$	0 0 1 2 2 0 2	$\frac{\frac{1}{2}}{\frac{1}{2}} + \frac{1}{2} + $	$\frac{3}{2} + \frac{3}{2} + \frac{3}$	$\frac{5}{2} + \frac{5}{2} + \frac{5}$	$\frac{7}{2}^+$	
$N_8(J)$			4	5	3	1	
$10_{ m F}$	$\frac{1}{2}$ $\frac{1}{2}$ $\frac{3}{2}$ $\frac{3}{2}$ $\frac{3}{2}$	0 2 0 2	$\frac{1}{2}^+$ $\frac{1}{2}^+$	$\frac{3}{2} + \frac{3}{2} + \frac{3}$	$\frac{5}{2}^{+}$ $\frac{5}{2}^{+}$	$\frac{7}{2}^+$	
$N_{10}(J)$			2	3	2	1	
$1_{ m F}$	$\frac{1}{2}$ $\frac{1}{2}$ $\frac{3}{2}$	0 2 1	$\frac{1}{2}^+$ $\frac{1}{2}^+$	$\frac{3}{2}^+$ $\frac{3}{2}^+$	$\frac{5}{2} + \frac{5}{2} + \frac{5}{2} + \frac{5}{2}$		
$N_1(J)$			2	2	2	0	

Two derivative













Examine Flavor structure of baryons constructed from u, d s quarks.

• Can identify predominant flavor for each state: Yellow (10F), Blue (8F), Beige (1F).

• SU(6) x O(3) Counting

• Presence of "hybrids" characteristic across all +ve parity channels: **BOLD Outline**

R. Edwards et al., Phys. Rev. D87 (2013) 054506

Recent extension to doubly-charmed baryons







The elephant in the room...



States unstable under strong interactions

Meson spectrum on two volumes: dashed lines denote expected (noninteracting) multi-particle energies.

Allowed two-particle contributions governed by cubic symmetry of volume



Calculation is incomplete.





Momentum-dependent I = 2 $\pi\pi$ **Phase Shift**

Dudek et al., Phys Rev D83, 071504 (2011)

Luescher: energy levels at finite volume \leftrightarrow phase shift at corresponding k







Momentum-dependent I = 2 $\pi\pi$ **Phase Shift**

Luescher: energy levels at finite volume \leftrightarrow phase shift at corresponding *k*

$$\det \left[e^{2i\boldsymbol{\delta}(k)} - \mathbf{U}_{\Gamma}\left(k\frac{L}{2\pi}\right) \right] = 0$$

Dudek *et al.*, Phys Rev D83, 071504 (2011) Dudek, Edwards, Thomas, arXiv:1203.6041

- Moving $\pi\pi$ system \rightarrow far more momenta below inelastic threshold
- Optimized single-pion interpolating operators → more precise determination of energies





Matrix in l



Energy Levels for Scattering States









Resonant I = 1 $\pi\pi$ **Phase Shift**



Dudek, Edwards, Thomas, Phys. Rev. D 87, 034505 (2013)

Extend to inelastic channels: Guo et al, Briceno et al.,





First - and Successful - inelastic

$$\det\left[\delta_{ij}\delta_{JJ'} + i\rho_i t_{ij}^{(J)}(E_{\mathsf{cm}})\left(\delta_{JJ'} + i\mathcal{M}_{JJ'}^{\vec{P}\Lambda}(p_iL)\right)\right] = 0$$

Parametrized as phase shift + inelasticity





Dudek, Edwards, Thomas, Wilson, PRL, PRD





Pole positions in complex plane







Summary

- Spectroscopy of excited states affords an excellent theatre in which to study QCD in low-energy regime.
- Determining the quantum numbers and the study of the "single-hadron" states a solved problem
- Lattice calculations used to construct new "phenomenology" of QCD
 - Quark-model like spectrum, common mechanism for gluonic excitations in mesons and baryons. LOW ENERGY GLUONIC DOF
- **Prediction** there are exotics in a range accessible to the 12 GeV Upgrade of Jefferson Lab!
- Next step for lattice QCD:
 - Calculations at closer-to-physical pion masses isotropic lattices
 - Baryons a challenge....
- Properties radiative transitions, form factors. Theoretical work! Hansen and Briceno





Variational Method + Distillation



Fit to $\lambda_0(t, t_0) = (1 - A)e^{-m_0(t - t_0)} + Ae^{-m'(t - t_0)}$ and plot $C(t)/e^{-m_0(t - t_0)}$

Reduced contribution of excited states

 $24^3 \times 64$ isotropic lattice $a_2 \simeq 0.75$ fm, SU(3)

Single "distilled" correlator

Fit to $C(t) = Ae^{-m_0 t} + Be^{-m' t}$

and plot $C(t)/e^{-m_0 t}$







...And for Rho







