Holographic Transport and Black Hole Horizons

Jerome Gauntlett







European Research Council

Established by the European Commission

In holography some very special quantities of the dual CFT are captured, universally, by the black hole horizon:

Equilibrium quantities:

• The temperature of the CFT is given by the surface gravity

$$\Gamma_H = \frac{\kappa}{2\pi}$$

• The entropy of the CFT is given by the area of the horizon

$$S_{BH} = \frac{A}{4G}$$

• Conserved charges

$$d * F = 0 \quad \Rightarrow \quad \int_{\infty} *F = \int_{H} *F$$

In seeking applications of holography to real materials, thermoelectric conductivities are important observables

$$\begin{pmatrix} J^{i} \\ Q^{i} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \sigma^{ij} & T\alpha^{ij} \\ T\bar{\alpha}^{ij} & T\bar{\kappa}^{ij} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} E_{j} \\ \zeta_{j} \end{pmatrix}$$
$$\zeta \leftrightarrow -(\nabla T)/T$$

DC conductivity matrix is universally obtained exactly by solving generalised, linearised Navier-Stokes equations for an incompressible charged fluid on the curved black hole horizon [Donos,JPG]

- Not a special case of fluid-gravity correspondence
- Can view as an exact version of old membrane paradigm [Damour][McDonald,Price,Thorne][...]

$$\left(\begin{array}{c}J^{i}\\Q^{i}\end{array}\right) = \left(\begin{array}{cc}\sigma^{ij} & T\alpha^{ij}\\T\bar{\alpha}^{ij} & T\bar{\kappa}^{ij}\end{array}\right) \left(\begin{array}{c}E_{j}\\\zeta_{j}\end{array}\right)$$
$$\zeta \leftrightarrow -(\nabla T)/T$$

Naively the DC conductivity is an IR observable but it depends on UV physics

e.g. CFT on Minkowski space is described by the AdS Schwarzschild black hole

Translational invariance \Rightarrow momentum conserved $\Rightarrow \bar{\kappa}_{DC} = \infty$

More precisely, $Re[\bar{\kappa}(\omega)] \sim \delta(\omega)$

General framework for dissipating momentum:

Holographic Lattices

CFT with a deformation by an operator that explicitly breaks translation invariance.

[Horowitz, Santos, Tong] [.....]

• For example, consider D=4 black holes with bulk scalar field

$$\phi(r, x^i) \rightarrow \frac{\phi_s(x^i)}{r} + \frac{v(x^i)}{r^2} + \dots$$
 $r \rightarrow \infty$

Corresponds to a deformation of the d=3 CFT:

$$L_{CFT} \to L_{CFT} + \int dx \phi_s(x) \mathcal{O}(x)$$

Holographic lattices are interesting

The lattice deformation can lead to:

• 'Coherent metals' aka Drude physics - smoothed out $\delta(\omega)$ [Hartnoll,Hoffman][Horowitz, Santos,Tong][...]

Arises when momentum is nearly conserved.

g Novel 'incoherent' metals strange metal [Donos, JPG] [Gouteraux] [....] 300 erature (K) 200 eml pseudogap Insulators and M-I transitions Fermi liquid antif superconductor [Donos,Hartnoll][Donos,]PG][.....] 01 0.3 0.1 0.2 0 hole doping

Plan of talk

- DC conductivity matrix by solving Stokes equations on the curved black hole horizon
- Comments and generalisations
- What else can we get from the horizon?

Dispersion relation for hydrodynamic modes associated with diffusion of charge - derive generalised Einstein relation from Einstein equations

Note recent work on studying diffusion and relations to quantum chaos: $D \sim v_B^2 \tau_L$ [Hartnoll][Blake][Sachdev,Lucas....]

DC Conductivity and Stokes equations

Illustrate with D=4 Einstein-Maxwell Theory

$$S = \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left[R + 6 - \frac{1}{4}F^2 + \dots \right]$$

Dual to d=3 CFT with global U(1) symmetry

Assume for now:

• There is a single, static black hole Killing horizon with planar topology and periodic deformations

Dual to deformed CFT in thermal equilibrium, preserving T-reversal invariance e.g. no magnetic fields

DC Conductivity and Stokes Flows

• Holographic lattice black holes - planar horizons

$$ds^{2} = g_{tt}dt^{2} + g_{rr}dr^{2} + g_{ij}dx^{i}dx^{j}$$
$$A = A_{t}dt$$

with $g_{\mu
u}$ and A_t functions of (r, x^i) , periodic in the x^i

• Behaviour at AdS boundary $r \to \infty$

 $ds^{2} \rightarrow r^{-2}dr^{2} + r^{2}\left[g_{tt}^{\infty}(x)dt^{2} + g_{ij}^{\infty}(x)dx^{i}dx^{j}\right]$ $A \rightarrow A_{t}^{\infty}(x)dt$

i.e. sources for boundary T^{tt} , T^{ij} and J^t

• Killing horizon at r = 0: is spatially modulated (in general)

• Setup: Perturb the black hole by DC sources E_i , ζ_i

$$\delta(ds^2) = \delta g_{\mu\nu} dx^{\mu} dx^{\nu} + 2tg_{tt}\zeta_i dt dx^i$$
$$\delta A = \delta a_{\mu} dx^{\mu} \leftarrow tE_i dx^i + tA_t\zeta_i dx^i$$

• Behaviour at AdS boundary:

The only sources are $E_i \quad \zeta_i \qquad \zeta \leftrightarrow -(\nabla T)/T$

• Behaviour at the horizon: perturbation is regular

• Naively: now solve full bulk perturbation. However...

• Result I: Zero modes of the electric and heat currents at the horizon are equal the zero modes of those in the CFT

Illustrate with electric currents:

Bulk equations of motion $\nabla_{\mu}F^{\mu\nu} = 0$

Define the bulk electric current density as $J^i = \sqrt{-g}F^{ir}$

$$\partial_i J^i = 0, \qquad \partial_r J^i = \partial_j \left(\sqrt{-g} F^{ji} \right)$$

At AdS boundary, $J^{i}(x)|_{\infty}$, is local current of dual CFT Observe zero mode $\overline{J}^{i} = \int d^{2}x J^{i}$ is independent of radius

$$\bar{J}^i|_{\infty} = \bar{J}_0^i$$

• Result 2: Obtain local currents $J^i(x)|_0$, $Q^i(x)|_0$ on horizon as functions of E_i , ζ_i and hence DC conductivity of CFT

Use Hamiltonian decomposition of equations of motion with respect to the radial coordinate:

 $\mathcal{H} = N H + N_{\mu} H^{\mu} + \Phi C \,,$

Evaluate constraints at the "stretched horizon"

Find a decoupled sector for a subset of the perturbation which forms a closed set of equations. Moreover, they give $J^i|_0$ and $Q^i|_0$

Define

$$(v^i, p, w) \quad \leftrightarrow \quad (\delta g_{it}^{(0)}, \delta g_{rt}^{(0)}, \delta a_t^{(0)})$$

 $Q_0^i = 4\pi T \sqrt{h} v^i$

$$J_0^i = \sqrt{h} [a_t^{(0)} v^i + h^{ij} (E_j + \partial_j w)]$$

Find system of Stokes equations:

[Donos, JPG]

$$\partial_i Q_0^i = 0$$

$$\partial_i J_0^i = 0$$

$$-2\nabla^i \nabla_{(i} v_{j)} = (4\pi T \zeta_j - \nabla_j p) + a_t^{(0)} (E_j + \nabla_j w)$$

Linear, time-independent, forced Navier-Stokes equations for a charged, incompressible fluid on the curved black hole horizon

Comments I

• The formalism can be generalised from Einstein-Maxwell to any two derivative theory of gravity in holography

E.g. Scalar fields ϕ give extra viscous terms appear in the Stokes equations $\nabla_j \phi^{(0)} \nabla_i \phi^{(0)} v^i$ [Banks,Donos,JPG]

where $\phi^{(0)}(x)$ is the value of the scalar on the horizon

Comments II

• Break T-reversal invariance [Donos, JPG, Griffin, Melgar]

Allow for equilibrium holographic lattices with magnetic fields but also local magnetisation currents and heat magnetisation currents

$$J_{\infty}^{(B)i} = \partial_j M^{(B)ij}$$
$$Q_{\infty}^{(B)i} = \partial_j M_T^{(B)ij}$$



Find: extra Lorentz and Coriolis terms in Stokes equations on the horizon

Comments III

Onsager relations

[Donos, JPG, Griffin, Melgar]

 $\sigma^T(S) = \sigma(S^t) \qquad \alpha^T(S) = \bar{\alpha}(S^t) \qquad \bar{\kappa}^T(S) = \bar{\kappa}(S^t)$

Prove by obtaining the Stokes equations from a novel variational principle, which is a functional of the fluid degrees of freedom and the time-reversed degrees of freedom.

Comments IV

[Donos, JPG, Griffin, Melgar]

Generalise to higher derivative theories of gravity

E.g. Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet gravity in D dimensions, coupling $\tilde{\alpha}$

$$\nabla_i (\delta^i_j - 4\tilde{\alpha} G^i_j) v^j = 0$$
$$-2\nabla^i \left(S^{kl}_{ij} \nabla_k v_l \right) = \left(\delta^i_j - 4\tilde{\alpha} G^i_j \right) \left(4\pi T \zeta_i - \nabla_i p \right)$$

where

$$S_{ij}^{kl} \in [1 - \tilde{\alpha}2(D - 4)(D - 1)] \,\delta_i^{(k}\delta_j^{l)} \neq \tilde{\alpha} \left[2h_{ij}R^{kl} + 4\delta_{(i}^{(k}R_{j)}^{l)} + 4R_i^{(k}\delta_j^{l)}\right]$$

The $\tilde{\alpha}$ corrected shear viscosity [Brigante,Liu,Myers,Shenker,Yaida]

 h_{ij} Horizon metric

 G_{ij} and R_{ijkl} Horizon metric Einstein and Riemann tensor

Comments V

There are some special holographic lattices for which we can say more about the Stokes equations [Banks,Donos,JPG,Griffin,Melgar,...

- a) Q-lattices can solve Stokes equations in closed form
- b) One dimensional lattices can also solve in closed form
- c) Perturbative lattice (Drude physics)
 - can solve Stokes equations perturbatively and obtain general results on leading order effects
- d) Hydrodynamic limit of holographic lattice: $k_L/T \ll 1$ Fluid-gravity also valid in this limit and the Stokes equations can be expressed in terms of UV data
- e) Interesting bounds on conductivity can be found [Grozdanov,Lucas,Sachdev,Schalm]

Diffusion modes

Holographic lattices

- Momentum not conserved
- Charge is conserved ⇒ quasinormal modes associated with diffusion of charge

Hydrodynamic modes $\omega, k_i \rightarrow 0$ and should exist for any k_L

• Satisfy Einstein relation?

$$D = \sigma \chi^{-1}$$

Quick hydrodynamic argument:

- Conservation law $\partial_t \rho + \nabla_i j^i = 0$
- Constitutive relation $j^i = \sigma^{ij} \nabla_j \mu = \sigma^{ij} \chi^{-1} \nabla_j \rho$
- Diffusion equation

 $\partial_t \rho = D^{ij} \nabla_i \nabla_j \rho$

 $D^{ij} = \sigma^{ij} \chi^{-1}$

Can include heat currents and get another diffusive mode (coupled) [Hartnoll]

Issues:

- To get finite results need momentum dissipation
- Not in hydrodynamic limit in general
- "Conductivity" in Stokes equations is not the CFT conductivity
- Diffusion in inhomogeneous media is somewhat murky

Construct time source free quasinormal perturbation

 $P \equiv \{g_{\mu\nu}, A_{\mu}, \phi\}$

- Time dependent ansatz $\delta P(t, r, x) = e^{-i\omega[t+S(r)]}\delta \hat{P}(r, x)$ Ingoing boundary conditions at horizon, source free at ∞
- Einstein equations: radial equations plus constraints at horizon

 $\partial_i J_0^i = i\omega(\dots) \qquad \qquad \partial_i Q_0^i = i\omega(\dots)$ $-2\nabla^j \nabla_{(i} v_{j)} \dots = i\omega(\dots)$

Set $i\omega = 0$ get Stokes equations with $E_i = \zeta_i = 0$

No longer a closed systems of equations when $\omega \neq 0$ Nevertheless we get dispersion relation for diffusion modes! Solution:

• Identify the quasinormal mode at $\omega = k_i = 0$ Start with background holographic lattice solution $P_{BG}(r, x)[\mu, T]$

Generate static perturbation via

 $\begin{array}{c} T \to T + \delta T \\ \mu \to \mu + \delta \mu \end{array}$

Correct with diffeos and gauge transformation to respect b.c.'s

Solve constraint equations in long wavelength expansion
 Data on horizon for DC conductivity appear

Data on horizon for static susceptibilities appear

Result:

• Susceptibilities $c_{
ho} \equiv T(\partial s/\partial T)_{
ho}$ $\chi \equiv (\partial \rho/\partial \mu)_T$

$$\xi \equiv (\partial s / \partial \mu)_T = (\partial \rho / \partial T)_\mu$$

• Define $\bar{\kappa}(k) = \bar{\kappa}^{ij} k_i k_j$, $\alpha(k) = \alpha^{ij} k_i k_j$, $\sigma(k) = \sigma^{ij} k_i k_j$

$$\kappa(k) \equiv \bar{\kappa}(k) - \frac{\alpha^2(k)T}{\sigma(k)}$$

Dispersion relation for coupled diffusion modes

$$i\omega^{+}i\omega^{-} = \frac{\kappa(k)}{c_{\rho}}\frac{\sigma(k)}{\chi}$$
$$i\omega^{+} + i\omega^{-} = \frac{\kappa(k)}{c_{\rho}} + \frac{\sigma(k)}{\chi} + \frac{T\left[\chi\,\alpha(k) - \xi\,\sigma(k)\right]^{2}}{c_{\rho}\chi^{2}\sigma(k)}$$



• DC thermoelectric conductivity can be obtained by solving Stokes equations on black hole horizons

• Diffusion modes can also be obtained - also can be found in spontaneous case

• What else can be found at the horizon?